

An adjourned meeting of the Board of Supervisors of Albemarle County, Virginia, was held on February 25, 2012, at 6:00 p.m., Lane Auditorium, County Office Building, McIntire Road, Charlottesville, Virginia. The meeting was adjourned from February 22, 2013.

PRESENT: Mr. Kenneth C. Boyd, Mr. Christopher J. Dumler, Ms. Ann Mallek, Mr. Dennis S. Rooker, Mr. Duane E. Snow and Mr. Rodney S. Thomas.

ABSENT: None.

OFFICERS PRESENT: County Executive, Thomas C. Foley, County Attorney, Larry W. Davis, Clerk, Ella W. Jordan, and Senior Deputy Clerk, Travis O. Morris.

Agenda Item No. 1. The meeting was called to order at 6:00 p.m., by the Chair, Ms. Mallek.

Agenda Item No. 2. Pledge of Allegiance.
Agenda Item No. 3. Moment of Silence.

Agenda Item No. 4. Adoption of Final Agenda.

The agenda was accepted as presented.

Agenda Item No. 5. Brief Announcements by Board Members.

There were none.

Agenda Item No. 6. From the Public: Matters Not Listed for Public Hearing on the Agenda.

Ms. Mallek said that budget comments would be taken during that public hearing. She emphasized that Albemarle County has a very high and successful standard for operation of public meetings, and high expectations for all the participants, Board members and the audience to create an atmosphere of respect to each other. In addition, the Board has no tolerance for any kind of disruptive behavior. She stated that all comments needed to be addressed to the Board as a whole, not to any individual. Ms. Mallek said that because of the number of speakers who had signed up, comments would be limited to two minutes each.

Ms. Jamie Morgan addressed the Board, stating that they demand that the rapist and perpetrator resigns. She said that rapists must learn to hear and understand the word "no". By letting the perpetrator to remain in office, they are allowing him one more non-consensual "yes." Ms. Morgan stated that they refuse to let the rapist be rescued in a false cloak of innocence, or take the silent advice of the perpetrator. By refusing to resign, he is sending the message that his actions are acceptable, and she is present to state that they are not. Ms. Morgan said that more than one in four women are violently raped in their lifetime, and Mr. Dumler has contributed to that statistic. The rapist has no right to represent these women any longer.

Mr. Dumler's actions have produced incurable trauma for the many women he has assaulted. When a woman's body is used as a weapon against her, she can never escape that weapon. Ms. Morgan added that Mr. Dumler is now responsible for the lifelong pain and the struggles these women will now face; 84% of rapists will claim that what they did is not rape even though they admit to forcing a non-consenting person into sex. She said that Mr. Dumler has silenced the women he has assaulted without facing any real consequences and is a disgrace to his community, his gender and his position. The people will no longer stand idly by as politics and patriarchy are prioritized and defended over their bodies and their rights. They will no longer accommodate a serial rapist. She said that Mr. Dumler's persistent actions are sending the message that the community does not support sexual assault victims and survivors. They need to stop listening to rape apologists who make excuses for rape. She asked those in support of her message to stand, adding that they will be at every event in which Mr. Dumler is present until he resigns – including the times he is leaving jail. She stated that Mr. Dumler will resign.

Mr. Jordan McNeish, a resident of the Rivanna Districted, thanked the members who voted to censure Dumler. He said that the Democratic Party cannot claim that it stands up for women's rights when it stands behind an admitted sex criminal. Mr. McNeish said that he feels that it is inappropriate for Mr. Dumler to vote on the budget due to conflicts of interest that arise from his sexual battery conviction. He said that Mr. Dumler is currently under probation with Offender Aid and Restoration. The funding request for OAR was \$164,782 – yet the recommendation is \$5,000 less than this amount. It is not appropriate for Mr. Dumler to vote to underfund an office that needs this funding to properly supervise him along with other criminals. Mr. McNeish stated that one of the goals of funding the Police Department is to reduce the number of crimes against people, and it is quite hypocritical for Mr. Dumler to vote to advance such a goal when he is precisely the kind of person the police should be watching. He asked Mr. Dumler to abstain from voting on the budget, and to resign his position immediately.

Ms. Constance Stevens, a resident of the Rio area of Albemarle County, said that as a woman and mother of a college-aged daughter she is disgusted that there is an admitted and convicted sexual

batterer sitting on the dais. Ms. Stevens emphasized that there are many people who share her beliefs, and they condemn sexual violence in any form and declare and admitted and convicted sexual batterer is not fit for public office. She said that they offer sympathy and public support for victims of sexual violence and deplore reprehensible and slanderous attacks on sexual abuse victims, which intend to bully and shame them into silence. Ms. Stevens said that victims of sexual violence and their supporters will not be silenced, and are not going away. She stated that everyone is judged by the company they keep and the stands they make. There is no possible justification for publicly supporting an admitted, convicted sexual batterer to remain in office. People's words and deeds will live forever. They will remember the people and the organizations, what they said about this.

Ms. Nancy Carpenter, a resident of the Scottsville District, said that she is present to speak on the potential devastating results from the upcoming sequestration on March 1. Ms. Carpenter said that Virginia will lose funding for approximately 170 teachers and teachers aides in middle and high schools, but also children who are challenged could see as many as 170 of their staff members cut because of the sequestration. She stated that the smallest children, attending Head Start and early Head Start, will face elimination of 1,000 spaces for that program.

Ms. Carpenter said that many of the single parents she works with rely on childcare assistance to be able to work, and that program will also be cut. She said that nutrition for seniors will also be cut through reductions to the Meals on Wheels program, and the state could find that 700 fewer victims of domestic violence have services available to them – as Violence Against Women could lose up to \$172,000 in funding. Ms. Carpenter suggested that Board members contact elected Congressional representatives – Senator Kaine, Senator Warner, and Representative Hurt – and ask them to stay in Washington until the situation is fixed.

Ms. Kali Cichon addressed the Board, stating that would like to challenge the members to go home and look in the mirror and explain why they would defend a rapist, why it is acceptable to ask someone to leave the room for applauding, but not for assaulting women, and to justify why it is more important to them to advance their political careers than to protect women from sexual assault. Ms. Cichon said that no one has made the argument that Mr. Dumler is innocent, and what they are saying is that rape is not a big deal. She asked if someone should be in a position of power if they are not trusted around female relatives and friends. She said that she challenges Board members to never actually mention their character when trying to advance their own careers, ever again.

Mr. Steven Peters said that Ms. Mallek opened the meeting with comments about “high expectations and high standards” and stated that people must follow the rules and not clap. The people would really like to see is no convicted sexual batterers on this Board. Mr. Peters said that the liberal leadership is standing by itself and will be damaged by this, and 70% of Democrats have signed the Dumler recall petition. Mr. Peters said he does not know who Mr. Dumler thinks he's representing, but it is not very many people left in the Scottsville District that want to have much to do with him.

Mr. Earl Smith, a resident of Keene, in the Scottsville District, said that he stood before the Board several weeks earlier with a petition he started to recall the vote for Mr. Dumler. Mr. Smith said that two weeks prior to this meeting, he stood in Scottsville from 8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m. and got about 100 signatures. He stated that five women approached him and asked what he was doing, and ended up signing the petition. Mr. Smith also said that Mr. Dumler has made comments that he himself would sign the petition, and Mr. Smith offered to allow him to do that.

Mr. Keith Morris addressed the Board, stating that he finds the situation with Mr. Dumler deeply troubling, as the issue of sexual abuse is one of the most serious faced in our culture. Mr. Morris said that sexual assault is a widespread epidemic, and the long-term effects on its victims are devastating. He stated that for victims there is little actual healing, just intensive therapy to help them cope with the pain of their damaged lives.

Mr. Morris said he knows the criminal situation with Mr. Dumler. He knows the charges and the plea deal Mr. Dumler asked for and received. Mr. Morris said that he knows a relative of the victim, who explained to him the details of what actually happened – which he finds loathsome. He stated that he finds it outrageous that Mr. Dumler is still seated on the Board. The public support received from the Democratic Party is deeply troubling as well. Mr. Morris said that he is a Democrat who has never voted Republican, but this situation goes way beyond politics. The members of this Board are figures of authority and their word goes out to the community, and the community listens. The community is now hearing the worst thing he can possibly imagine. He stated that the message sent to boys and young men is that sexual assault is fine if you are important enough of a person, and to girls and young women the message is sexual assault really does not matter. Mr. Morris said that to the thousands of victims of sexual assault in the community, the message is “your suffering is not honored.” He urged Mr. Dumler to do the right thing, the decent thing, and resign.

Mr. Randolph Byrd addressed the Board, stating that it seems that there is a problem as to how have Mr. Dumler resign and still retain political parity on the Board. Mr. Byrd asked if it ever occurred to the Board members to come to a compromise whereby if a Democrat leaves the Board, there could be a reappointment of a Democrat via the Board or a special election. He said that if that does not happen, this

group will show up at ever meeting and have this conversation over and over again. Mr. Byrd stated that a Board member can be recalled for "adverse material effects," and as their meetings get hijacked and their emails become unmanageable, there will be material adverse effects for all of them. That is what the court is looking for and these folks are evidence. The Board members will not be able to escape material adverse effects, and they will be gone.

Mr. Tom Olivier addressed the Board, stating that he has lived in southern Albemarle County for the past 30 years. He said that the community is better off when they let elections decide who represents them, let courts resolve legal issues, and let local governments focus on its many challenging designated responsibilities. Mr. Olivier said that Mr. Dumler has worked hard to meet with constituents and address their concerns, and has shown himself to be exceptionally quick at grasping complex policy options that are part of all the challenges that this Board has to deal with in its designated tasks. Mr. Olivier stated that he values Mr. Dumler as a person and a neighbor, and he looks forward to Mr. Dumler's contributions to Albemarle County as a Supervisor for many years to come.

Ms. Pat Napoleon, a County taxpayer and concerned retired Albemarle County teacher, said that she appreciates the three Supervisors who have sensibly called for Mr. Dumler's resignation. Mr. Snow's sincere statement of late demonstrated heartfelt compassion and courage, and she commends him. Ms. Napoleon said that Mr. Dumler's friends and supporters are not fooling anyone with their failing strategy of offering lame excuses for dangerous behavior. She stated that two Board members are inappropriately protecting Mr. Dumler and are "making a grave error in doing so. Ms. Napoleon said that the public has seen through faulty posturing for this issue. Mr. Dumler has too much on his plate – thus preventing effective leadership. She said that supporters are causing harm and using everyone involved. She said that supporters feeble and selfish arguments for keeping Mr. Dumler on the Board are just a cover-up for maintaining political power. She asked if those Board members who are guarding Mr. Dumler just be honest with the public and admit the real reasons for defending him. One of the goals of the Board's budget is to ensure the health and safety of the community. In light of a Board member admitting guilt for sexually abusing a woman, should a new County goal include vulnerable women against assault from a Board member. The Board of Supervisors should not serve as a revamped rehab program.

Mr. Charles Winkler, a City resident, said that two weeks ago millions of women around the world were rising up to protest the injustices of rape and abuse toward women – and meanwhile, self-proclaimed ERA supporters were rising up here in this community to tell them to ignore the voices of abused women. Mr. Winkler said he would like to review the County's official policy on sexual harassment from its personnel manual, emphasizing that a County Supervisor is a County employee and is paid an annual salary from the general fund. He stated that all County taxpayers have a vested interest in the status of any given Supervisor, not just voters of a given district as some have claimed here. Mr. Winkler said that County policy states that sexual harassment in the workplace is prohibited for all employees because it violates state and federal law. Sexual harassment may even involve non-employees. He said that a Supervisor's workplace goes beyond the walls of the building or meeting room, and County policy states that sexual harassment may occur during or even after work hours. Mr. Winkler asked if it is a "hostile, abusive or offensive work environment" if women citizens are forced to meet with a Supervisor convicted of sexual battery. He said that substantiated allegations or a finding of sexual battery constitute grounds for disciplinary action, including immediate leave without pay or immediate dismissal.

Ms. Helen Swift-Dovel, President of the Jefferson Area Tea Party, presented the following statement: "The Jefferson Area Tea Party (JATP) joins the many other community entities, including the Sexual Assault Resource Agency (SARA) and the Charlottesville Daily Progress, in calling on Mr. Dumler to do the honorable thing and step down from his position on the Albemarle County Board of Supervisors. We withheld commenting on his felony charge of forced sodomy until the criminal process was completed. Mr. Dumler ultimately pled guilty to the reduced charge of sexual battery and his plea agreement with the Commonwealth enabled him to avoid potential criminal charges on two additional cases alleging criminal sexual misconduct. Many voters in Mr. Dumler's district, who now feel frightened or intimidated, are without representation because they are avoiding contact with him. If constituents cannot or will not meet with Mr. Dumler on issues of County business because he has entered a guilty plea to a criminal sexual offense, then he cannot fulfill the obligations of his position to his constituents. Instead of being forced to conduct business with Mr. Dumler many constituents have chosen to contact Supervisors from other districts, which has had a disruptive effect on the Board's ability to do its work. These Scottsville District voters have expressed to the other supervisors both their discomfort with having any further contact with him and/or concerns that contact would appear to be a tacit acceptance of his behavior." Ms. Swift-Dovel said the JATP is looking after the taxpayers. She reiterated the waste of tax dollars being spent on this issue.

Ms. Lena Saville addressed the Board, stating that Mr. Dumler is sitting on his computer and not even paying attention to what people are saying. Ms. Saville said that he exhibits a certain coldness and to expect him to do the honorable thing is not him.

Ms. Carole Thorpe, a resident of 1318 Oak Tree Lane in the County, addressed the Board, asking Mr. Dumler to see the hurt that is happening in the community. She said that she holds no personal ill-will against Mr. Dumler, but it is tearing his community apart. Ms. Thorpe said that if Mr. Dumler cares about the citizens of Albemarle County, he should search his heart and do the right thing. She also asked the

Board to consider the budget tonight through the lens of whether items are “the role or the function of County government” to be providing a particular service.

Agenda Item No. 7. **PUBLIC HEARING** to receive comments on the County Executive’s FY 2013/2014 Recommended Budget. (*Advertised in the Daily Progress on February 24, 2013.*)

Mr. Foley addressed the Board, stating that the FY14 combined capital and operating budget totals \$321,153,000 which is balanced on the existing tax rate of 76.2 cents per \$100 of assessed value resulting in a slight decrease in the tax bill of the average homeowner. Mr. Foley said that last year’s proposed budget was a much more modest approach of moving forward, given the challenging times the County had been through. He stated that the budget was entitled “Progress and Opportunity,” but it was in the context of the recession the County had been working through and was more focused on catching up and recovering. As examples Mr. Foley said that that staff unfroze police officer positions instead of adding them in an attempt to catch up, and also looked to one-time capital monies to move forward with projects such as the Crozet Library. He stated that while most of the steps were to catch up they still reflected important progress as compared to the previous three years, but were still in the context of recession. Mr. Foley said that the recommended FY14 budget takes a much more proactive approach, and to a much greater degree focuses on strategic investments that support the organization’s sustainability and create opportunities and capacity for moving it forward. He stated that the budget as proposed is much more about the future and where we’re going, rather than the past and where we’ve been, not about catching up and recovering, but about building, investing and advancing.

Mr. Foley said that as staff put the budget together for the year ahead, they stayed more focused on the vision of a “thriving county” in strategic goals and trying to make progress moving forward. In doing so, he said they established three primary goals for the budget going forward: to build resilience and support the ability to respond to change while sustaining core operations; to invest in creating organizational capacity that yields a positive return, improving the ability to perform and produce over the long term rather than the short term; and to advance strategic priorities that position the County for the future.

He stated that the County continues to be an organization committed to excellence, even as the economy has changed and things start to improve. Staff is not losing sight of the transformational efforts that were put in over the last few years. Mr. Foley said that they are focused on the hallmarks of an excellent organization, reducing costs, repositioning resources, and focusing on strategic priorities. As an example of this continued focus, he said, there are three important points about the proposed budget: expenditures are less than FY09 – more than five years ago – despite growth in population and mandates and obligations since that time; the number of general government positions on a per-capita basis is roughly equivalent to the FY03 level – more than 10 years ago; and the tax burden is less than the 2010 level for the average homeowner and provides a slight reduction from last year, making it the fifth year in a row with a reduction in taxes for the average homeowner. Mr. Foley commented that the County’s commitment to excellence is foundational, and continues to be reflected in the budget.

Mr. Foley presented a pie chart breaking down the total revenues for the County, and said that about 45% are property taxes, 21% are other local taxes and the remainder is state taxes with a small amount from federal sources. He reported that local revenues are up about 2%, state revenues up 4%, and federal revenues up about 3%. Mr. Foley said that the total expenditures of the \$321 million, the school system expenses account for almost 60% of total expenditures, including capital program, debt service and operations; general government makes up about 35%, including public safety, human services, public works and general government administration; and 5% of expenditures go to the City for the revenue-sharing agreement.

Mr. Foley reported that a few highlights in the budget include: an increase of 2.3% over the FY13 budget, or \$7.2 million, and a tax burden that is less than 2010 with a slight reduction for the average homeowner due to declining real estate values. He said that there are signs of new construction and growth in the County which are helping to offset the loss in current values. He stated that the modest economic recovery and enhanced collections has also helped turn the tide. Mr. Foley reported that on the expenditure side, local government operations have increased 3.8% - shoring up core services, improving them, and investing in future improvements. He noted that the budget also reflects an increase to school operations of 2.2%, with a decrease in CIP funding because some major projects are working their way through and there are not a lot of new projects in this budget.

He said that the major component of revenues is general fund revenues, which is where all property taxes come in to support all the rest of County operations. Mr. Foley said that general property taxes in the general fund make up about 63% of total revenues, with local operating taxes making up about 20.5%, and state revenues comprising about 10%. He stated that there has been a 2.7% overall increase in major sources of revenue, with general property taxes up just under 2% in spite of the decline in value, because of new construction and some other sources of revenue. Mr. Foley said that other local taxes have increased by 3.5%, and other revenue sources have remained relatively flat – with federal revenues comprising a very small share at under 10%. He explained that in 2010, the average home value was just under \$300,000, and the tax bill was \$2,208; as values have declined, the tax rate has not been raised to offset that loss of revenue, so the tax bill for the average homeowner over that period of time is \$104 less. Mr. Foley emphasized that values are fluctuating up and down depending on what type of property a person has and where they live in the County.

Mr. Foley reported that with general fund expenditures, school support makes up approximately 51% of general fund expenditures – which is the County’s transfer to school operations and support of CIP

and debt service. He said that public safety makes up 16%, followed by health and welfare at 8%, and revenue sharing at 7% of the general fund. Mr. Foley reported that the 2.7% overall increase in general fund expenditures, the largest increases support public safety and education – with public safety up \$1.8 million and education up \$2.6 million. He added that there is also a large increase in the proposed budget for libraries, which is considered to be support of the educational system overall beyond the public schools. Mr. Foley said that in addition to the revenues he discussed which have risen 2.3%. There have been some major changes in expenditures that have freed up some resources to reallocate to priorities. He reported that the City fire contract has been reduced by over \$700,000, being reallocated to pay for some services; regional jail costs have been reduced by about \$200,000 – and even though the revenue-sharing number is \$17 million, it is down by about \$600,000.

Mr. Foley stated that in terms of building core operations, there are a number of initiatives with public safety in the FY14 budget such as the first full year of operations for Pantops EMS service and the Ivy Fire Station – which is suppose to open by July of 2014. An, addition of three fire/rescue positions for daytime coverage for the Route 29 South Ivy area in response to some changes in service from volunteer support from the CARS station. He said there is funding for a division chief for volunteer services to help improve the County's working relationship with volunteers, and a full year of 24-hour EMS coverage on Route 29 North – the busiest area in the County. Mr. Foley noted that on a map provided the "shields" show the current system and where the County provides service for EMS. With the investments that have been made in the current year and extending into next year, he said, the system in terms of coverage has been greatly improved. Mr. Foley explained that rather than having the City respond to calls out in the County, those services have now been relocated to places where they can improve service while generating revenue to help pay for the service through EMS billing revenues.

Mr. Foley reported that the budget adds four new police officers – two focused on typical responding to calls; two new social services positions due to a dramatic workload increase during the recession; improvements in maintenance and care of current facilities through the General Services and Parks and Recreation Departments. Regarding the goal of investing to create capacity to ensure a positive return for quality services, the budget includes Photo Safe revenues that are generated from red-light enforcement to help pay for a new traffic safety officer to help offset the service demand. He said that the budget also takes a step forward in creating a stormwater program to meet a new mandate from the federal government as a first step toward a longer-term program that would involve establishment of a stormwater facility in FY15. He said that the budget also adds a grants management position to help generate more revenues to offset services, and to better manage that program.

Mr. Foley stated that some long-term positive returns are expected in terms of investments, including establishing an economic development program, establishing a centralized risk management program for the County to be more efficient in how funds are used, expanding use of technology by adding a new technology position, and considering whether or not to put major capital projects out to the voters through a bond referendum. He said that the budget reflects some fees to help do the studies required to consider moving that forward.

Mr. Foley said that the third goal, advancing strategic priorities to position the County for the future is addressed through the strategic plan adopted by the Board the previous year and the seven major goals established. He said that the goal of "creating an excellent educational opportunity for all citizens" is supported in the budget through the recommendation of \$154 million for the schools operating budget, an increase of \$2.8 million – or just under 2%. Mr. Foley said that local support increases by \$2.6 million, and it moves school bus replacement from the schools' operating fund into the capital fund, therefore freeing up the obligation of about \$1.4 million that would typically be spent on school bus replacements each year. He stated that it also supports school facility improvements, with Agnor Hurt Elementary School and Murray High School scheduled for some additions and renovations. Mr. Foley noted that it also supports a school resource officer to improve security in the schools, the expense of which will be split 50/50 between local government and schools. He added that the budget includes an 11.6% increase for the libraries, most of which is focused on the opening of the new Crozet Library in Crozet and money to implement the new regional services agreement in place for the libraries.

He reported that the second goal, related to community facilities, has a capital budget of about \$21 million as proposed, and it does increase the capital transfer because of the growth in revenues by about \$500,000 to help pay for some capital projects. Mr. Foley said it also increases year-end monies that will be left over if there is a particularly good year. He mentioned that the Crozet Library and Ivy Fire Station are currently under construction and would be completed in the year ahead. Mr. Foley stated that the third goal of "a diverse and vibrant economy" is supported through memberships paid to various organizations in the community, such as TJPED, which will see an increase. He said that the budget continues the establishment and funding of the economic opportunity fund, which is available to help attract jobs and investment into the community for the types of industries that meet the County's targets.

Mr. Foley said that goal four relates to protecting historic scenic and natural resources. He stated that the budget prepares the County for addressing new mandates such as water quality improvements to help protect the Chesapeake Bay – and it takes the first steps with some study money to determine how best to address those challenges. He said that the fifth goal regarding health and safety has been discussed at length, and in addition to expansion of fire and EMS, the budget funds 100% of volunteer station operations based on a funding formula. Mr. Foley said that the budget increases contributions to JAUNT, which serves the elderly and disabled by about 13.5% to help keep up with increased ridership.

Mr. Foley stated that the sixth goal of "individual responsibility and citizen ownership" is addressed through the reallocation of funds to help pay for a volunteer coordinator to try to save County dollars and provide opportunities that citizens might be interested in. He said that the budget also continues efforts to

support advisory councils throughout the development areas. Mr. Foley said that the seventh goal related to supporting the workforce is supported in the budget with a 2% merit increase. He explained that a merit increase is something rather than just a typical raise. It requires that employees meet high standards for performance before they qualify for 2, 3 or 4% raise. Mr. Foley said that this is the first time in four years that the County has been able to fund performance pay. Mr. Foley stated that the budget also increases funding for recruitment initiatives for police and fire. He said that there is a health insurance increase impacted in the budget. He stated that both the County as the employer and the employees themselves are projected to see a 7% increase in their health insurance fees.

Mr. Foley reported that the budget also provides funds for a mandated Line of Duty Act insurance obligation. He explained that obligation use to be the states' and it has been passed down as a new mandate that covers those who serve in public safety. He said that the budget meets the County's obligations to agencies such as the SPCA and other community organizations and includes just under \$17 million to the City for revenue-sharing. He also said that the budget provides reserves to protect against uncertainties and maintain the AAA-bond rating.

Mr. Foley reviewed the goals addressed in the budget. He noted that it improves the County's fire and EMS response system as well as core operations for the police and social services; creates a centralized risk management function; invests in economic development; advances the strategic plan by increasing funding to the schools and library system; and establishing a stormwater program. He said that staff feels confident that the budget goes a long way in addressing some of the concerns and challenges faced and moves the County from looking back to looking forward, and investing and moving forward in providing high quality for citizen. He stated that this is the first time the County has been able to take steps forward in quite some time.

Mr. Foley emphasized that there still are challenges ahead. He said that this budget takes some initial steps towards addressing unmet needs such as stormwater, and a bond referendum because of the capital program. He said that those are the study parts of the budget and the Board will be spending a good bit of time this summer determining how to best move forward in those areas, and to what degree the County will be able to move forward. He said that how the capital program is funded is "a significant issue," as it is basically maintenance right now and does not address new needed facilities. So staff will have to come up with some other ways to fund those that don't currently exist. Mr. Foley said that the growing population in the County has put increased demands on staff, and while they are in good shape currently they will have to address workload impacts and other needed support in the future.

Mr. Foley said that the Board is moving from talking about enhanced services to addressing core services. He said that they will need to discuss what things are core services and what things are important to the quality of life here – and what investments will need to be made.

Mr. Foley concluded by referencing the County's vision statement, which says that "In Albemarle in 2040, we hope to be a thriving county anchored by a strong economy and an excellent education system that honors its rural heritage, scenic beauty and natural and historic resources while fostering attractive and vibrant communities." He emphasized that achieving that vision is something that staff is taking a major step towards this year, while acknowledging that there are a lot of things left undone that will require more conversation and direction by the Board of Supervisors in the year ahead.

He mentioned that there would be a number of budget work sessions over the next several weeks, from March 4-13. He said that the Board will make adjustments and changes they feel are appropriate to the proposed budget – and then a public hearing will be held on March 27 on what will essentially be the Board's budget. He said that is the point in which the tax rate will be set and the Board will make final decision on what to approve for the upcoming fiscal year. Mr. Foley added that the final budget adoption is scheduled for April 3.

Mr. Snow asked Mr. Foley to address sequestration. Mr. Foley stated that the County does have \$1 million in reserves set aside in the event that sequestration happens, as staff is unsure about what the federal cuts may mean to services. He said that the reserve will enable the County to continue those services for the next year and a half to deal with those impacts.

Mr. Snow asked what happens to the money in the case it is not needed. Mr. Foley said that if it isn't needed it will go to the capital program.

At this time, the Chair opened the public hearing.

Ms. Lauren Ryan said that she is the parent of a 4th and kindergartener in the schools and lives in the Samuel Miller district. Ms. Ryan said that she and her family moved to the area due to the quality of the schools. She said that her family feels that investment in education is the one area that will provide long-term returns that will benefit the County through training and better, more qualified employees for future growth. She stated that she volunteers in her daughter's school and sees firsthand the impact that quality teaching has on children. Ms. Ryan noted that she has observed how teachers have leveled the playing field for students who have not attended preschool and those who come from highly enriched households. She said that a longer term investment in schools will continue to make sure that each student regardless of the resources outside of school will have access to quality resources in school. Ms. Ryan encouraged the Board to fully fund the school budget as well as the CIP and stated that the County is currently spending less per student while unfunded mandates have increased.

Ms. Jillian Johnson addressed the Board, stating that she is a teacher at Walton Middle School. She said that in thinking about how to make the best use of time, she was reminded about a story of the

roman god Janice – who is a mythical creature that has two faces. She stated that she thought about Janice because for the past two years she has seen two different faces of education. Through her work as a teacher in Michigan – where areas like Detroit, Flint and Grand Rapids were once among the Country's most modern economically brilliant leading edge cities. She said that they were the power houses of innovation, education and community. Today, Detroit and its schools are in very different places – bankrupt in more ways than one. Ms. Johnson said that Albemarle is not like Detroit, but one day it could be. She stated that these are difficult economic times with building expenses on a constant upward plain. She said that people are hurting, and many of them work for the County. Ms. Johnson said that the employees are very important and are the dedicated, highly skilled, energetic people who believe in the mission the Board has set forth for the county. She stated that the employees more than believe in the mission they make it come true. They are the people on the front line who is the most powerful asset in making sure that the County does not become Detroit one day. Ms. Johnson said that in over the past five years, County employees have had an average salary increase of about ½ of 1%. She stated that this is a road that leads not to educational excellence but to the places in our country where states take over local education; where businesses don't locate; and where students don't graduate. Ms. Johnson encouraged the Board to fund the school budget with the additional money in order to meet their strategic planning goal.

Ms. Anne Geraty addressed the Board, stating that she is Vice-President of the Albemarle Education Association and a teacher at Meriwether Lewis Elementary School. Ms. Geraty said that several years ago she encountered a former student – that had received special education services – who told her that he had made it to college and it was her belief in him that helped him get there. Ms. Geraty said that educational excellence means providing all students with the resources they need to succeed in society once they graduate from County schools. She said that we cannot afford to waste the potential of even one student. She stated that the County has an admirable record of offering a diverse range of programs that encompass the needs of all students which is a responsibility and a moral obligation. Ms. Geraty said that the sequestration cuts for education would take effect in five days, and among the hardest-hit programs would be intervention funding – support for students who are most in need. She said that these students and their families need leaders to step up and protect the quality of the specialized education they need to fulfill their potential as learners, citizens and contributors to the County and the country. Ms. Geraty stated that the Board has a unique opportunity to demonstrate leadership, vision and compassion and stand up for the most vulnerable learners by providing funding that will close the gap that now exists in the school funding request. She said that this action is the most effective measure the Board can take to protect the classroom for all the students in the County. She stated that with this action the Board can enable teachers who are entrusted with the sacred duty of passing the torch of knowledge to every member of the next generation, to ignite the flame of learning in all students. Ms. Geraty said that teachers needed to the Board's help to do that and asked them to fund the school division's request.

Ms. Marta Keane, COO of the Jefferson Area Board for Aging, addressed the Board and thanked County staff for the recommendations for JABA's funding. She quoted Aristotle, "The way you can judge a nation is by the way it treats its most vulnerable citizens," and Pearl Buck – "Our society must make it right and possible for old people not to fear the young or be deserted by them, for the test of a civilization is the way it cares for its helpless members." Ms. Keane said that in 2010, there were 14,000 residents over the age of 65 living in Albemarle – and of that, 7% lived at or below poverty, with 29% living alone without any other support. She stated that in FY12, JABA served over 5,500 individuals and families through its many programs, and is projecting in FY14 over a 7% increase in that number. Ms. Keane said that JABA knows that they need to continue to collaborate and find the best ways to meet the growing needs in the most sufficient manner. She stated that JABA recognizes that their biggest challenge will be affordable housing and assisted living for those residents unable to continue to live in their own homes. She stated that JABA's biggest goal is to keep people aging in place and to the degree that their current programs are funded they look forward to continue doing that. Ms. Keane thanked the Board for their support.

Dr. Charles Battig addressed the Board, commenting that there is something for everyone in the proposed budget. He said that the concept of limited government is "long past". He stated that the Board has a difficult job to allocate too many worthy sounding causes – to which the answer is there is never enough or never will be enough. Dr. Battig said that on Page 202, under expenditures – CIP, the ACE Program shows zero, and on Page 229, under future projects, there is over \$14 million – and he asked where it was coming from. He said that this is money taken from all taxpayers to the benefit of very few as was discussed in an earlier article in 2011. He also said that Biscuit Run is a big example of that. Dr. Battig stated that the Sexual Assault Resource Agency has condemned a Supervisor, and their budget has increased 10% - from \$20,000 to \$22,000. He said that he wondered if the \$2,000 reflects the extra expenditures on behalf of the Supervisor – and asked if that Supervisor would be able to vote on this item, since he is deeply involved.

Dr. Richard Lindsay, Board member of the Jefferson Area Board for Aging, addressed the Board, stating that the population is changing. He said that the population is aging in a way that assumes that 1 in 5 Virginians are above the age of 65. He stated that what he has learned a physician is that the importance of healthcare is not as important as other things such as housing, the environment etc – which is the situation that JABA has at Mountainside. Dr. Lindsay said that Mountainside is an amazing resource; it's part of the Crozet community; it serves part of the population and its senior's home. He stated that he takes student there and when interviewing residents they get an idea of the tremendous importance that it is in their lives. He stated that the Board's past support has been vital to JABA and continued support in the future will be very important. Dr. Lindsay said that the Affordable Care Act has no long-term care piece, as it was removed because it was fiscally so unresponsive to needs. He said that the average nursing home cost in Charlottesville is about \$77,000 a year, so assisted living is a vital part of the financial picture.

Ms. Traci Kelsey addressed the Board, stating that she is a kindergarten teacher at Woodbrook Elementary School and the parent of two Albemarle High School graduates. Ms. Kelsey said she is here to ask the Board to fully support Dr. Moran's budget. She stated that she knows firsthand the value of having the support of teacher's assistants, ESL teachers, math specialists and special education teachers. She said that she has been teaching for nine years and has had many students who have struggled academically and emotionally, and need those teachers. Ms. Kelsey said that she along with many other teachers is making less money than last year, and both she and her husband – who also works for the County – have part-time jobs. She stated that she loves her job as a teacher and makes a difference every day. She added that she has taught some of the Board members children and grandchildren. Ms. Kelsey said that Mr. Foley spoke about "looking forward" and how important it is for the County to look forward to its goals. She said that that the County cannot meet its goals if the Board is not going to support the budget and the education that is needed. She stated the Albemarle is a very demanding County herself included and she wants the best education that her kids can have. Ms. Kelsey asked the Board to support the budget so that every child will have the best education.

Ms. Elaine Hendrick said that she teaches third grade at Woodbrook Elementary School. She said that wanted to speak to the value of two positions at the school – a math specialist and third grade teaching assistant. Ms. Hendrick said that the Woodbrook's math specialist is an invaluable resource to all teachers and students and comes into her classroom every week to build lessons that build number sense and computation strategies. Ms. Hendrick stated that she sees her students' confidence and mastery of skills increase, and the math specialists and instructional coaches have also provided a professional development agenda centered on the current practice of teaching mathematics that helped teachers gain perspective on their students' abilities – kindergarten through fifth grade. As well as providing framework for discussion on how they can better serve students. She said that the specialist often shares instructional materials with the teachers and new information from the state regarding SOL testing and preparation, and works throughout the day with students individually or in a small group. She stated that it is fully evident that she utilizes her expertise to collaborate with teachers to meet the mathematical needs of all of the students. Ms. Hendrick said that they also have a teaching assistant in third grade and she sees and feels the positive impact that she has on students every day. Often teacher reading and math groups so that they can better differentiate better instruction for all learners; will cover recess duty to allow teachers more time for planning; and willingly works with a child or small groups that need help. Ms. Hendrick said that she values her presence, flexibility and professionalism and added that she sees her role in the third grade as integral. She asked the Board to support Dr. Moran's budget request.

Mr. Frank Podrebarac addressed the Board, stating that he is president of the Albemarle Education Association and would speak on behalf of those who are grateful for the position of the Board regarding education. Mr. Podrebarac said that each Board member is to be commended for taking a strong stand on the importance of a quality education, for the future of the community as well as the children. He stated that the County's target industry study identified the health and medical device field as having a very high potential for job creation and level of pay over the next several years. Mr. Podrebarac said that the school division developed its Health and Medical Sciences Academy last year to help increase student awareness, interest and skills in the health and medical field – and it quickly became the first in the state to earn the designation as a Governor's Regional Academy. He stated that next year, the number of students enrolled in the academy would double from 24 to 47 students. He said that it what a strong partnership between government and the business community can do. Mr. Podrebarac said that educational excellence is about moving forward – not backward – and the school's budget is hardly ambitious, ensuring that the County will struggle to stay in place with the only new initiatives being those devoted to the enrollment, growth, and federal and state mandates. He emphasized that those drivers are not controlled by the school division or the Board, but it is their obligation to pay the expenses associated with having more students in schools, more staffing for special needs students – including the virtual learning courses that are coming in. He said that it would be counterproductive in the County's admirable commitment to education quality for the Board to say that they would force the school division to make cuts that would make it less competitive.

Mr. Mark Marini addressed the Board, stating that he is a teacher at Albemarle High. He said that he would be talking about time. Mr. Marini stated that half of his day is teaching 9th grade English, with a quarter of his day going to planning and grading from those classes and the other quarter going to work with his special education caseload, with the last half doing response to intervention. Mr. Marini said that after 17 years as a teacher, he was asked to work on response to intervention, which finds students prior to failure and putting in systems so that they don't fail. He stated that this is far more efficient and cost-effective than tutoring. This year he said he that he has worked with the English Department to ensure students don't fail the 11th grade SOL and can graduate, along with helping to provide the skills that business owners say they want students to have. Mr. Marini said that he also works with the Biology Department to implement curriculum-based measures in an effort to help students become more successful on the Biology SOL. He stated that he also works with students who have failed the SOL as 12th graders. Mr. Marini said that some of those students have now passed and there are still some who will not pass, will not walk, and will not get diploma and stay in Albemarle County. Mr. Marini asked the Board to fully fund the Schools budget for the students who need that extra support.

Ms. Holly Bittle addressed the Board, stating that she has been a County resident for about 20 years and has a 4th grade and 7th grade student in the schools. Ms. Bittle asked the Board to fully fund the school budget. She noted that it is a "maintenance budget" and does not include funding for any new initiatives – only funding for new mandated programs and increased costs due to growth. She said that the growth in the County has been supported in the form of approvals of new housing developments, which are very appealing for young families with school-age children. She stated that at this point in time, she would like to see the County stop just getting by and start planning for the future. Ms. Bittle said the

County created designated growth areas that will over time need additional funding for both operations and capital improvements to maintain the quality of life that County citizens have come to value. She said that as a parent and a taxpayer, she wants to see the school system continue to invest in the future, as the students of today will be the workers of tomorrow and will support the County and its citizens. She stated that although not all County taxpayers have children – a world-class school system attracts and keeps good employers and professionals, whose tax dollars support our local government. She added that she also hoped the Board would be able to fully fund an addition onto Crozet Elementary to meet the needs of that growing part of the County. Ms. Bittle said that she would be willing to incur minor tax rate increases over time to invest in the future of the County, particularly in the school system.

Mr. Jeff Coleman addressed the Board, stating that he is a resident of the Scottsville District and a teacher in County schools. Mr. Coleman said that the proposed budget works to provide schools with funding to help students achieve academic excellence at all grade levels, provides for enhanced learning opportunities, career-focused training, and a safe learning environment. He requested that the Board repealed the annexation and revenue-sharing agreement between the City and County to allow for the full funding of this proposed budget and future budgets. He stated that since the agreement's inception in 1982, over \$160 million of County taxpayer money has been paid to the City of Charlottesville, and at the time the agreement was signed Board members knew the potential effect on County school funding, but times have changed. Mr. Coleman said that the cost of public education and the overall County budget has steadily increased since 1982, and yet there has been little or no negotiation, revision, or repeal of the agreement. He stated that while the County struggles to find the means to support the school budget, the City had a \$4 million surplus. Mr. Coleman said that in researching the local composite index and revenue-sharing agreement, City School Board Member Ned Michie wrote: "If the County is sure it is unhappy with and wants to renegotiate the revenue-sharing agreement, there is no moratorium on voluntary annexations, so I would suggest you bring some land when you want to talk." He also stated that the Board responded to his own letter by stating "there was no need to change the revenue-sharing agreement," and that such an undertaking would be futile. Mr. Coleman said that he disagrees with the "bully tactics" and hands-off approach of elected officials, urging at least a thorough, transparent review that includes taxpayers.

Ms. Lisa Carter a southern Albemarle resident addressed the Board, asking that they consider reinstating the funding for the Albemarle County Fair – which they last funded in 2006-07 at a level of \$10,000. Ms. Carter said that the fair board is a private nonprofit group that is essentially having to fundraise everything for the fair noting that she has kids in 4H. She stated that her main request is to put the funding for the County Fair back into the budget. Ms. Carter noted that support of the fair falls into their 2040 pledge of "honors rural heritage."

Ms. Erika Herz addressed the Board, stating that she has two children at Greer Elementary School. She said that she is a strong supporter of the County's business community and economic development for this region. She stated that she is also here to express support for fully funding public schools, as well as keeping the desirable culture and economy of the County – which demands a well-educated workforce. Ms. Herz said that offering a world-class, well-funded education system is necessary to keep the best and the brightest here. She stated that when researching schools for her oldest child to attend, they visited several private schools in addition to Greer and were delighted to find that they loved Greer – "we've had a wonderful experience." Ms. Herz said that the children are in reading and math groups appropriate to their levels thanks to the school being staffed accordingly, and she is grateful that there are support teachers on hand to enable children who need extra attention to get it. She said that anyone who has spent time in a classroom knows that the delicate balance of activity and engagement in the classroom cannot be managed without incredible special ed teachers and many others. To even cut one of those professionals out of the budget is a mistake, especially since many of the students who receive special support at Greer and other schools may not even have the option of getting that support privately. Ms. Herz said that Greer is a vibrant learning community with excellent leadership and unbelievable devoted teachers. She said that they don't take anything for granted – every success takes tremendous effort by the administration. Teachers pay out of pocket for some of their professional development activities. Ms. Herz thanked the Board for their dedicated service to the community and requested that they fully fund the schools in the upcoming budget cycle.

Ms. Nancy Paulson addressed the Board, stating that she is speaking tonight as a parent, taxpayer, County resident and co-president of the Meriwether Lewis PTO. She said that she has addressed the Board many times over the past few years concerning the need to fully fund the public schools and their programs. Ms. Paulson stated that while she is very proud of the County's schools, teachers and students – over the past five years the Board has trimmed and trimmed the schools' funding, and investment in school facilities "has become stagnant." She stated that the spending per student is less than it was in 2008, and parents have been asked to absorb costs – with high school faculty being asked to teach more classes with more students in them. Ms. Paulson said that PTOs, band boosters, etc. are selling lots of products to fund things like uniforms, trips, books for the libraries, intervention specialists, technology and more. She stated that she understood the need for parents to pay for extra-curricular surcharges, but the cuts in Albemarle County Schools have been felt at every level and ultimately there is nowhere else to cut. Ms. Paulson also stated that the Board has been short-sighted in deferring and ignoring necessary capital improvement projects for the public schools. She urged the Board to reconsider and find a way to fully fund the school budget and to be anticipatory and responsible and allocated more to the Capital Improvements budget even if it requires a modest increase in the County's historically low tax rate.

Ms. Meghan Eddy addressed the Board, stating that she is the parent of two children in Albemarle County – one at Cale Elementary, and one at Walton. She said that she is the previous PTO president at Kale and is the current PTO president at Walton. Ms. Eddy said that the Board should support the school

budget and work to get the funding back to where it was previously, as well as planning for the future. She stated that the administrators and teachers work extremely hard at both schools, which have very diverse populations that need to be supported.

Mr. Gary Grant addressed the Board, stating that he would read a statement that was unanimously approved by the Jefferson-Madison Regional Library Board in an 8 to 0 vote – of which he is a member. Mr. Grant said that the JMRL Board commends Mr. Foley for his recognition of libraries as a core function of government, as included under the County's #1 goal: education. He stated that the JMRL Board commends the FY14 budget recommendation because it covers all costs required of Albemarle County in a revised regional agreement between Albemarle, Charlottesville, Greene, Louisa and Nelson; it covers the necessary staffing required to successfully open Albemarle's newest library in Crozet; it accommodates pay raises for JMRL employees in FY14 in an effort to stay competitive with peer localities as well as with peer library systems; and it covers the negotiated rent increase at the Northside Library. He said that the JMRL Board does note that the budget does not cover the public's frequently requested Sunday hours restoration of Northside Library; does not cover further bookmobile outreach to constituents such as the elderly; and it does not cover adequate staff time required to cover library opening hours. Mr. Grant said that JMRL Board does commend Mr. Foley for enhanced library funding in the FY14 budget.

Ms. Ashby Kindler addressed the Board, with Dave Rogers and Lisa Jones, stating that they represent the principals and assistant principals of their schools. Ms. Kindler said that they see the budget as a "reasonable request" to position them to continue doing the work they have mapped out with teachers and for students. She stated that Dr. Moran's budget theme is "meeting students at the leading edge of our potential," and it is known that students must be prepared to compete in a workforce that can't even be imagined. Ms. Kindler said that they focus on all of their classrooms to emphasize lifelong learner standards to develop critical thinking, creativity, cooperation and communication – the skills needed for students to put us on the leading edge of innovation. She stated that the budget is about meeting the needs established for today, and is not about new technology or added programs – with the only new initiative being development of the mandated online high school courses. This budget is about "doing what we do now, well." Ms. Kindler said that most of the Tier I items are expenses that must be incurred, and the Tier II items are about maintaining a commitment to the standards already set and services already provided. She stated that art, music and PE in large schools and AP in middle schools are standards that have not yet been achieved. She said that the budget restores funds to respond to intervention, school resources officers and assures the continuation of CPCS. She also said that the only new initiatives at the tier II level are for training bus drivers in CPR, First Aid and crisis intervention. Ms. Kindler said that the budget asks the Board to support the schools and to do what the Board has asked the schools to do in the way that the Board and the community has asked them to do it. She said that the budget does not ask the Board to fund world languages, summer planning time, full implementation of the coaching model, and transportation for magnet programs – there are no tier III or IV wish lists. She stated that a community's first task is educating its children and if they don't get that right, they won't get anything right. "That's how we will be judged – please fully fund the budget."

Ms. Laurel Geis said that she has three children in County schools and is here to support the budget and urge them to fully fund it. She also stated that she is going to talk about the importance of the gifted, intervention and special ed programs. Ms. Geis said that one of her children was diagnosed with ADD and has always struggled in school, but this year a connection happened through her teacher and a special education teacher who gave her "the right tools that gave her a voice." Ms. Geis said that her daughter now uses a laptop and has become a good writer, and her success is due to the fact the County has a strong intervention program, a strong special education program, and fantastic teachers who deserve a pay raise. She stated that there are incredibly talented teachers in the ACPS, and they need to be able to retain them. Ms. Geis also noted that her oldest child was part of the state champion Destination Imagination team from Henley Middle School, and her 4th grader will now also participate on a DI team.

Ms. Holly Stancil addressed the Board, stating that she has two children at Meriwether Lewis – a third grader and a kindergartener. Per, Mr. Foleys closing remarks in terms of core values and quality of life Ms. Stancil said that she can think of no more important single factor than school excellence and encouraged the Board to fully fund Dr. Moran's budget proposal. Ms. Stancil said that she and her husband chose to live in this area so their children could have access to the schools, and if the quality of education slips below what the County is capable of they can't justify paying a premium in tax dollars and still having to pay private school tuition so that her children's academic needs are met. She stated that in a school with no gifted education and limited special education, a classroom teacher is expected to be all things to all levels of learners, which is a formula for mediocrity. Ms. Stancil said that the teachers and administrators here are capable of much more than just maintaining the status quo, they are world-class educators with ideas and the motivation to lead schools confidently into the 21st Century. She stated that the County will only continue to attract new residents if the schools are doing more than just scraping by. Ms. Stancil encouraged the Board to fully fund the Superintendents proposed budget as a minimum acceptable level for supporting students.

Mr. James Stern a resident of North Garden addressed the Board, stating that 2013 Medicare Part B monthly premiums are \$104, \$147, \$210, \$273, \$336 per person depending on income level. Mr. Stern said that County employees currently contribute \$40 per month for healthcare, while the poorest seniors on Medicare will pay six times that amount for a plan with hospitalization, well-care supplement and prescription coverage. He stated that many property owners have not had raises in year but seniors are hit harder than most. He said that the Board of Supervisors can't control Medicare, gas or food prices but the numbers 0, 7 and 9 are their responsibility. Zero is the amount is the amount in the last five years that an individual County employee has seen their healthcare contribution increase; seven is the number the proposed budget increased by – both employee contribution and taxpayer contribution; nine – the

proposed budget will only increase individual employee's healthcare contributions by nine cents per day. Mr. Stern said that the budget proposals numbers translate to taxpayers paying \$2,737 more than in 2003 and yet the individual employees will on pay \$9 more a month. He asked the Board to tier employee healthcare contributions so that the lowest scale employees stay at \$40 a month and to increase the highest scale employees to \$242 a month – the same as a retiree is required to pay for their contribution Medicare. Mr. Stern said that the Board needs to run a County, and the "carnival sideshows" must stop and to please work it out.

Ms. Jenny Commins addressed the Board, stating that she is co-president of the PTO at Meriwether Lewis Elementary and is here to support County schools. Ms. Commins said that as PTO co-president she has spent the last two years working closely with teachers and very creative administrators. She said that at their school they have worked to supplement shortfalls, but she is concerned because she sees no additional areas to be cut that will not affect children directly. Ms. Commins also expressed concern that she sees no evidence of advanced planning for construction of new schools to meet growth in the western feeder pattern, and it's imperative that the Board set a plan in place now to meet this need and this growth – as it will be here tomorrow or maybe sooner. She urged the Board to fully fund Dr. Moran's budget.

Ms. Olivia Heapes addressed the Board in Spanish, stating that speaking another language when you're younger is much easier and she doesn't understand why it isn't taught in elementary schools. She said that she is worried that it will be much harder to learn if she doesn't get to take Spanish again until middle school.

Ms. Kylie Heapes addressed the Board, stating that she is a 5th grader at Stony Point and just started learning a foreign language. Ms. Heapes said that next year she would be at Sutherland Middle School, but found she wouldn't be able to take Spanish there except as an exploratory class – which means she won't start taking an actual language class until the 7th grade. Ms. Heapes said that she is worried that she will be behind all of the kids who have been taking a language class for years. She said that it makes sense to take a second language class as it will help the U.S. economy, and it's important to be able to communicate with all other people in the world.

Ms. Andrea Heapes addressed the Board, stating that she has three children enrolled at Stony Point Elementary, as well as one who graduated from Albemarle High School. Ms. Heapes said she is here to ask the Board to fully fund the budget proposed by the School Board. She said that she and her husband chose Albemarle after researching many areas because of the schools. She expressed concern that after four years of "maintenance only" budgets, she fears that the County is losing their competitive edge and are not putting in place the innovations and programs that will allow children to succeed in a competitive global economy. Ms. Heapes said that when she looks at what other districts are spending per child, she questions Albemarle's commitment to educational excellence. She stated that the benefits of learning a second language help the individual learner but also enhance economic competitiveness and help maintain political and national security interests. To wait until a child is in middle or high school puts them at a disadvantage and fails to capitalize on the window of opportunity for easily learning a language. Ms. Heapes encouraged the Board to consider fully funding the schools' request, and also asked them to resolve the issue discussed at the beginning of the meeting.

Mr. James Hingeley addressed the Board, stating that he is the Public Defender for Albemarle County and Charlottesville – which represents indigent defendants in all courts. He said that in October 2012, the Public Defender's office submitted a funding request to Mr. Foley for \$76,716 to address the substantial disparity in compensation between Albemarle County prosecutors and public defenders. Mr. Hingeley said that one of the goals in the County's strategic plan is "to promote a valued and responsive workforce that ensures excellent customer service." He posed the question how do the Public Defenders fit into the workforce – with the closest comparison being the County's prosecutors. He stated that the Commonwealth's Attorney is a state Constitutional officer and the prosecutor's office is funded by the State Compensation Board; the Public Defender's office is funded by the Virginia Indigent Defense Commission. He said that both offices are state agencies, and employees of both offices work in the Albemarle courts to provide essential services to County citizens. Mr. Hingeley said that the County recognizes prosecutors as valued members of the County workforce, and asked if it was time to recognize public defenders as well. He stated that public defenders and prosecutors work on opposite sides of the courtroom but have equally important roles in ensuring that justice is done. He said that an aspect of the County's strategic goal on workforce. Mr. Hingeley explained that if divide seven and a half position in the Public Defender's office and compare them to counterparts in the prosecutor's office you would find that the County supplements the prosecutor's pay by \$234,928 annually. He added that the County does not supplement the public defender's pay at all. He emphasized to the Board that if they fund the local supplement, they will go a long way toward achieving the County's strategic goal on workforce.

Ms. Lisa Medders addressed the Board, stating that she is the mother of two students at Baker-Butler Elementary and that school's PTO president. Ms. Medders said that she is happy to speak in support of the proposed school budget for 2013-14. She stated that as a taxpayer she can find no better way than to use tax dollars to support public schools. She stated that Baker-Butler and the County in general are well known for their high educational standards and their support of community. She said that Dr. Moran's proposed budget will maintain this level of excellence. Ms. Medders stated that as a mother of two elementary school age children she has witness firsthand the vast spectrum on students needs. She said that in almost each time she has volunteered in the classroom different students are being pulled out for additional help with reading, language and math skills or for gifted enrichment. She stated that she is amazed and impressed by the amount of individualized attention each student receives and if they were to lose the special needs teachers because of lack of funding all of the children would be negatively affected. Ms. Medders emphasized that parents, caregivers and students at her school are extremely

invested in the school, with parents contributing over 3,800 hours volunteering last year – and raising over \$26,000. She stated that this is money they contribute out of pocket to get the school more books, family nights, classroom supplies, and more. Ms. Medders said they are continuing to do their part, and hope that the Board will do theirs by passing the proposed school budget.

Ms. Vivian Newton addressed the Board, stating that she is assistant to the administrator at Mountainside Senior Living in Crozet, which is managed by JABA. Ms. Newton said that since she has been in her position, she has seen the needs, conditions and circumstances of the residents living at Mountainside on auxiliary grants. She stated that most residents there would like to live on their own, in their own homes, but they are in positions where they are unable to do so. Ms. Newton said that these people worked and supported their families most of their lives, and now they are in a position where they are elderly or have medical conditions that prevent them from taking care of themselves or financial situations that prevent them from getting home care. She said that most residents don't have families or relatives who can financially or able to care for them. Ms. Newton stated that Mountainside is dedicated to helping residents live their lives as best they can with the help from the County through auxiliary grants. She added that many residents could not live there were it not for the Board's help with money from the County, as some residents barely have enough money each month just for essentials. Ms. Newton asked the Board to keep money in the budget for the elderly in the County and that it may be one of us someday.

Ms. Alberta Corey addressed the Board, stating that she has lived at Mountainside Senior Living for five years and is 87 years old. Ms. Corey said that Mountainside provides a service that is greatly needed in Albemarle, and has given residents exceptional personal care. She stated that this is a new year, and while the Board may have second thoughts on what their priorities are and where their funding goes. She said that other elderly administrations besides Mountainside are well aware of what they will face in the future. Ms. Corey said that she learned a new word "sequester" and what it means to her is that "they'll give you a little now and take a little back later". She stated that Mountainside is aware that other organizations are requesting more funding as well. Ms. Corey said that the Board has been "more than generous" with what they have to work with, but Mountainside residents will need their help again. She stated that Mountainside is open for inspection, where they will see "smiling faces and close friendships." Ms. Corey thanked the Board of Supervisors for awarding Mountainside the "aging innovation" award in 2006 and said that in 2007 Mountainside received that Virginia housing award.

Robert Gest III addressed the Board, stating that he is a retired military officer and adjunct professor at the Federal Executive Institute, as well as being a board member of JABA and PVCC. Mr. Gest said that he is speaking tonight as a member of the Public Defender's Office Citizens Advisory Committee, and is asking the Board to "close the salary gap" between public defenders and prosecutors in the County. He stated that including administrative staff, prosecutors are paid "significantly more" than their public defender counterparts, and the payroll for 7.5 positions in the prosecutor's office is \$652,634 with the payroll in the public defender's office for the comparable position is \$471,453, making a 38% difference. Mr. Gest emphasized that public defenders and prosecutors should be "equal partners" in the criminal justice system, but when it comes to compensation clearly they are not. He said that the public defender's office received zero dollars from the County last fiscal year, while the prosecutor's office received a local supplement estimated at \$235,928. Mr. Gest stated that the citizens' advisory committee is asking the Board to consider funding the small sum of \$76,716 in this year's budget as a local supplement for the public defender's office, which would be a good first step toward erasing the pay disparity. He said that for years Albemarle County has supplemented prosecutor's salaries to ensure fair trials and now it is time to do the same for public defenders. Mr. Gest stated that quality defense pays dividends and when people are convicted, appropriate punishment must be imposed and the cost of excessive confinement must be avoided. He said that public defenders look for solutions to their clients' problems and focus on reducing the risk of reoffending and Albemarle County must eliminate the pay disparities without help from the state. He added that the County fails to see how the same logic does not apply to the public defender's office whose purpose is to guarantee equal justice under the law for those who do not have adequate means for a good defense.

Ms. Nancy Carpenter addressed the Board, stating that there is not enough money in the proposed budget for the Charlottesville Area Transit item. Ms. Carpenter said that there should be more than the 6.3% increase that's recommended, as there are areas on Route 29 North that need to be serviced – specifically Rio Road with the proposed Senior Center and CATEC. She stated that the County will need to keep cars off the road and will need a more developed transit system to get workers and to get people to the new and improved development areas that the County wants to see as part of its vision. Ms. Carpenter thanked the Board for being open to the First Amendment process, no matter how fierce the conversations are.

Mr. Robert Hogue addressed the Board, stating that school sports, music, driver's education, and all after-school activities should be fully paid for by the parents. Mr. Hogue said that the County should also look at online schools instead of building new buildings, as brick and mortar schools are becoming obsolete. He said that the U.S. spends as much money on education as any country in the world, yet ranks 25th. Mr. Hogue asked whether the difference is really made with tax dollars spent on education, or what parents demand from their children. He stated that the Board should work with the state to make libraries self-supporting with user fees, and suggested that Christmas tree sites not be free and should be the individual's responsibility. Mr. Hogue said there should be user fees and/or parking fees for County parks and walking trails, and everyone should look to the countries in Europe that are in trouble because of government overspending on "social programs and too many benefits." He stated that there could be cuts made in the FY14 budget.

Ms. Charlotte Hogue addressed the Board, stating that the proposed spending increases cause her to worry, as no group ever thinks they have enough money – and asked if services and projects were

being scrutinized to see if increased funding is really necessary. She asked if there were any follow-up checks being done to see if social services benefits were being spent for “actual needs” or on “nice to have items” by the recipients, adding that too many social programs are being abused. Ms. Hogue said that asking the government to take care of them is becoming a way of life for many, and the more government does for them the less responsibility they take. She asked the Board to continue to think long and hard before giving hard-earned tax dollars to nonprofits and projects such as book fairs and film festivals, emphasizing that extra-curricular activities should be self-supporting.

Ms. Elisa de Leon Farias a County resident addressed the Board, stating that she is a parent and volunteer at Baker-Butler Elementary. Ms. Farias said that as a volunteer she helps ESL students with math and vocabulary, and observes the valuable work of the special education teachers in the classroom. She stated that she supports the Superintendent’s budget proposal, which will continue giving opportunities for all children to learn and live up to their full potential.

Mr. Nicholas (Dick) Reppucci addressed the Board, stating that he has been a resident of the County for 37 years and a professor of psychology at UVA during that time. Mr. Reppucci said that his research, teaching and public service has been in the area of psychology, law, and youth development – especially as it relates to the juvenile justice system. He stated that he is here tonight to speak in favor of the proposed supplement to the salaries of the public defenders in order to achieve equity with those in the commonwealth’s Attorney’s office. Mr. Reppucci said that his son Nick who went through the County’s school system and the attended UVA as an undergraduate and graduate of the law school is a public defender here, and has also served in Colorado for a few years before returning to Albemarle. He stated that he also has a second son who is a public defender in Colorado, and the inequities that exist in compensation here do not exist there. Mr. Reppucci stated that his sons believe strongly that in order for justice to prevail, both the defense and the prosecution deserve the resources necessary to provide a vigorous defense and prosecution. He said that the County has an excellent Commonwealth’s Attorney office and excellent Public Defender’s office but the attorneys here are not equally compensated, and they should be. Mr. Reppucci said that as a professor he has to tell his students that in order to have a career in either defense or prosecution they need to be ready to take lower salaries than many if not most attorneys – but he doesn’t believe that they have to take unequal salaries as is currently the case in this community.

Mr. Tyler Coldren addressed the Board, stating that he is a 3rd grader at Stony Point Elementary. He stated that if the Board made budget cuts there is a chance they could take away art. He asked the Board not to take away art as it is the only class that everyone in his class actually likes. Mr. Coldren said that they do sketches and designs, and currently are learning about Greece. He said that his parents have told him that art class develops his imagination and critical thinking, and strengthens his problem-solving skills – which add to overall success in school while building self-confidence and self-discipline. Mr. Coldren again asked the Board not to make budget cuts.

Ms. Lisa Coldren addressed the Board, stating that she is Stony Point’s PTO president. She stated that her family moved to the County from the Philadelphia suburbs six years ago. She said that they chose Albemarle because of the excellent public education and quality of life, but is saddened that her kids’ education will suffer to the point that if this budget shortfall occurs, they will not receive the same services next year that they are this year. Ms. Coldren said that both of her children meet with the gifted resource teacher at Stony Point to support their strengths, and both look forward to those sessions. She stated that she and her husband are very happy that their needs are being addressed, which is just what they expected when they chose to live in the County. Ms. Coldren said that it would be unfortunate to cut services to children, as she sees firsthand the positive impact that the different services and programs have on students. Providing less programs and services leads to a less educated community, which leads to less money in the community, which leads to lower property values and a higher crime rate. Ms. Coldren said that Dr. Moran has asked only to maintain the current status with this budget request. She asked the Board to give Dr. Moran all the funding that she is requesting next year for the children.

Ms. Blake Walter addressed the Board, stating that she is a speech-language pathologist at Baker-Butler Elementary and Sutherland Middle School, and is here to express support for the schools’ funding request. Ms. Walter said that as student enrollment is expected to grow in the coming years, the current request includes staffing needed to address growing needs in special education and intervention staffing for at-risk students. She stated that working at both schools has showed her how vital these programs and support services are for many students. Ms. Walter mentioned a student who had an articulation delay and a severe stutter, and due through the response to intervention program she was able to work with the student weekly and by the end of the school year she was confident and conversational. She stated that recently at the middle school level, the functional skills class had the opportunity to interview post-high students who were proud to be working and succeeding. She said that in order for the intervention programs to thrive, they need highly qualified staffing, and if the County can continue to help the students excel then they are building the best citizens they can for the community. Ms. Walter urged the Board to support Dr. Moran’s funding request so the County can continue to provide a high quality education for students and support the needs of the at risk population.

Ms. Heather Swindler addressed the Board, stating that she is the parent of two children at Greer Elementary School. She said that the County has funded the schools less and less over the last few years at a lower and lower rate. She stated that Dr. Moran and staff have done an amazing job at maintaining an excellent educational system in the County and that is something that really needs to be kept. Ms. Swindler said that Dr. Moran’s budget proposal is “bare bones,” with nothing left to cut on it and if the County wants to keep an excellent system the Board needs to fund it – but even go beyond it in preparation for the future. She said that funding the schools is an investment in the children of today, the children of tomorrow, the economic community of today, and the economic community of tomorrow.

Ms. Rose Brown addressed the Board, stating that she is the Director of Stream Watch and appreciates Mr. Foley's recommendation to continue funding the program at the requested level. She explained that Stream Watch is the nonprofit charged with monitoring water quality in the Rivanna watershed, and provides the information to local governments as well as local partners and the community at large. Ms. Brown stated that the program has been in existence for 10 years, and the long-term monitoring program is the heart of the organization – with 46 monitoring sites, 27 of which are in Albemarle. She said that the County's support accounts for about 8% of their funding. She stated that Stream Watch has 30 local citizen volunteers, who give more than 1,000 hours per year of volunteer service, equaling more than \$40,000 in labor. Ms. Brown said that the local support helps to leverage funds for their long-term program as well as special projects. She stated that for FY13 they received almost \$70,000 in foundation and grant funding because they could demonstrate "solid local support." Ms. Brown said that in the coming year they will expand their monitoring to include 50 sites, will engage and train more volunteers, will continue their new bacteria-monitoring program, and will release a Rivanna-wide assessment. She stated that she is transitioning to a part-time program manager position, with a new executive director coming in. Ms. Brown thanked the Board for their support over the years and urged them to continue supporting Stream Watch.

Ms. Jane Kulow addressed the Board, stating that she is speaking on behalf of Build Crozet Library, the community fundraising group charged with raising the \$1.6 million for the new library's furnishings and books. Ms. Kulow thanked Mr. Foley for his support of education and his inclusion of "strong schools and libraries" in the budget's #1 goal. She said that the County schools and JMRL system do an excellent job of providing educational opportunities for all County residents. Ms. Kulow thanked the Supervisors for their support of the library construction, noting that it had already provided an economic boost to downtown Crozet. She stated that their fundraising is on schedule, with close to the amount needed for furnishing and over \$1 million out on proposals to individual, government and corporate donors for the balance needed to purchase books. Ms. Kulow said that the General Assembly just approved a budget amendment with a one-time grant of \$125,000 for Crozet Library for the purchase of new books, and the group appreciates the efforts of Delegate Steve Landes and Senator Creigh Deeds, who sponsored the amendment and supported it through conference to final vote. She added that she also supports full funding of the schools' budget proposal.

Agenda Item No. 8. From the Board: Matters Not Listed on the Agenda.

There were none.

Agenda Item No. 9. Adjourn to March 4, 2013, 9:00 a.m., Room 241.

At 8:08 p.m., Ms. Mallek **moved** to adjourn to Monday, March 4, 2013, 9:00 a.m. in Room 241 of the County Building. Mr. Dumler **seconded** the motion. Roll was called and the motion carried by the following recorded vote:

AYES: Mr. Dumler, Ms. Mallek, Mr. Rooker, Mr. Snow, Mr. Thomas and Mr. Boyd.
NAYS: None.

Chairman

Approved by Board
Date: 05/01/2013
Initials: EWJ